Prework Reminder: Please take the survey and bring your results:
https://www.viacharacter.org/survey/account/register

Please choose one option in response to each statement. All of the questions reflect statements that many people would find desirable, but we want you to answer only in terms of whether the statement describes what you are like. Please be honest and accurate! We cannot rank your strengths until you answer all of the 120 questions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Very Much Like Me</th>
<th>Like Me</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Unlike Me</th>
<th>Very Much Unlike Me</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Being able to come up with new and different ideas is one of my strong points.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I have taken frequent stands in the face of strong opposition.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I never quit a task before it is done.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Character, Competence, and Caring in Medicine--How Do We Measure Up?

Alexandra Harrington, MD
Michael Lund, MD
Ryan Spelley, PhD

Robert D. and Patricia E. Kern Institute for the Transformation of Medical Education

February 28, 2018

http://www.ucsfome.com/MedEd21c/

#UCSFMedEd21
Disclosures

None of today’s presenters have any disclosures to make.
Overview

Character, Competence and Caring in Medicine: How Do We Measure Up?

Medical education has made significant progress in moving from subjective evaluations of learners to objective measures of competence. Assessing other domains such as character and caring remains challenging but is more important than ever. Participants in this workshop will review the current state of assessment in these areas (for both learners and teachers) and work together to develop practical, usable tools for their own learning environment.
Learning Objectives

1. Define character and caring in a practical context and identify their importance in medical education.
2. Describe the current state of assessment for character and caring in medicine and how that differs from other fields.
3. Develop and implement potential assessment tools for measuring these traits.
4. Identify possible strategies for developing character and caring in learners.
# Workshop Agenda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Active Engagement Strategy</th>
<th>Presenter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Welcome and Introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>Ali</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Analyzing a Moral Dilemma</td>
<td>Video and Small Groups</td>
<td>Mike</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Character Overview</td>
<td>Small Group Discussion</td>
<td>Ryan and Mike</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Character Discussion and Questions</td>
<td></td>
<td>Ryan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Analyzing a Scenario</td>
<td>Small Group Discussion</td>
<td>Ali</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Debrief/Reactions</td>
<td></td>
<td>All</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Triple Aim for Health Care and Medical Education

Better Value
Reduced Cost

Better Care
Patient Experience

Better Health

Character
Competition

Caring

MCW’s Vision of Triple Aim for Medical Education

Triple Aim for Health Care
Measuring Competence: GME
Measuring Competence
Measuring Competence: UME

Figure 2. EPAs require the integration of competencies, usually from two or more domains. For each competency, then, milestones can be devised and then synthesized into descriptive narratives of expected behaviors for learners at pre-entrustable and entrustable levels of performance.
Measuring Caring

• Empathy
  o Jefferson scale of Empathy
  o Others

• Self-Compassion Test
  o [Link to test](http://self-compassion.org/test-how-self-compassionate-you-are/)
Measuring Character
Analyzing a Moral Dilemma
Report Out/Debrief
Measuring Character
MCW Character Sessions

Small Group Discussion Sessions on Character with MCW Faculty, Staff and Students
Thursday, September 28 at 7:00 a.m.
CHW Herma Heart Center Conference Room, 1st floor

Agenda

I. Welcome and Introductions ................................................................. José Franco

II. Brief Overview .................................................................................. José Franco

III. Discussion ....................................................................................... Participants, José Franco and Mike Lund

IV. Themes ............................................................................................. José Franco
# MCW Character Sessions

**Discussion Guide**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **1.** | **What does character mean to you?**  
*How does that apply to medical education?* |
| **2.** | **What are the qualities that define future physicians who align with the Kern Institute's focus on character, competence, and caring?** |
| **3.** | **How might character be woven into the way we teach and practice our professions at MCW?**  
*What are the opportunities and challenges of advancing character in medical education at MCW?* |
| **4.** | **Do you have any questions regarding the Kern Institute, in general?** |
## Discussion Guide

1. What does character mean to you? How does that apply to medical education?

2. What are the qualities that define future physicians who align with the Kern Institute’s focus on character, competence and caring?
Activity: Create Wordle

Based on your answers to question 1, add three words to the poll.
Tools to Measure Character

1. VIA
2. CGI
3. CASPer
4. Jubilee Centre
Measuring Character: VIA

VIA Resources

Discover Your Pathways to Flourishing

Dr. Seligman theorizes that the 24 VIA character strengths are the pathways to each of the 5 areas of well-being (PERMA). They underpin each element - deploying your highest strengths leads to:

- More positive emotion;
- More engagement;
- Better relationships
- More meaning; and
- More accomplishments

Core Virtues

- WISDOM
- COURAGE
- HUMANITY
- JUSTICE
- TEMPERANCE
- TRANSCENDENCE
Measuring Character: VIA

- Appreciation of Beauty & Excellence
- Bravery
- Creativity
- Curiosity
- Fairness
- Forgiveness
- Gratitude
- Honesty
- Hope
- Humility
- Humor
- Judgment
- Kindness
- Leadership
- Love
- Love of Learning
- Perseverance
- Perspective
- Prudence
- Self-Regulation
VIA: Your Character Strengths Profile

**GREATEST STRENGTH**

1. Gratitude

2. Kindness

3. Love of learning

4. Leadership
Measuring Character: CGI

Character Growth Index
© 2012 Mark Liston

Want to see how you are growing in character? That's what the Character Growth Index (CGI) will help you do. It’s easy and it’s a group thing so you won’t be graded.

The multiple-choice items say something about Courage, Kindness, Optimism, and other character strengths and asks how much it sounds like you. Many of the questions are similar so you can fly through them all in 10-20 minutes.

You can take CGI each year to see how much you’ve matured in character. If you want, you can get ideas from CGI to make character goals to shoot for, like being less stressed out or stronger when life is hard.

https://www.characterchallenge.org/character-growth-index
Measuring Character: CASPer Test

Your role is the more experienced employee

Questions to the Applicant:

1. What do you tell the other employee – go ahead and give the refund or abide by store policy? Justify your answer.

2. Assume you advise the newer employee not to give the refund, but she does anyway. Do you report this to your supervisor? Why or why not?

3. If you were asked to establish a policy for a new store around refunds, what aspects would you take into consideration?

https://takecasper.com/sample-casper-content/
# Measuring Character: Jubilee Center

## Table 3: Respondents’ Reported Personal Character Strengths

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figures in %</th>
<th>Undergraduate students</th>
<th>Graduate students</th>
<th>Experienced doctors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appreciation of beauty</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bravery</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creativity</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curiosity</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairness</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forgiveness</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gratitude</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honesty</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hope</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humour</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judgement</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kindness</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Source](http://www.jubileecentre.ac.uk/userfiles/jubileecentre/pdf/Research%20Reports/Virtuous_Medical_Practice.pdf)
MCW Focus Groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Faculty</th>
<th>Staff</th>
<th>Student</th>
<th>Patients</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MKE Campus</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional Campuses</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Key Themes from Character Conversations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What qualities define future physicians who are aligned with the Triple Aim of Healthcare?</th>
<th>Top 5 Responses: What does Character mean to you?</th>
<th>Character is...</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Compassion</td>
<td>Respect</td>
<td>...is very difficult to define—you know it when you see it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resiliency</td>
<td>Moral compass</td>
<td>..mentoring to cultivate and develop compassion and caring needs to be emphasized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competent</td>
<td>Integrity</td>
<td>...built through dealing with adversity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustworthy</td>
<td>Honesty</td>
<td>...creating environments that support the character development of a physician.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good listener</td>
<td>Values</td>
<td>...who you are when you think no one else is looking.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Defining Character

• Conducted Character listening sessions with faculty, students, staff and patients.

• Conducted a literature review on character and virtue in medicine.
  - Philosophy literature on Virtue.
  - Psychology and Education literature on Character.

• Identified themes in listening session notes.

• Interpreted themes via Character and Virtue frameworks.
Character Listening Session Data

• “Moral and ethical principles by which a person guides their life and their actions”.

• “You can lecture to medical students, but on the wards, they have to see hard decisions of walking the walk”.

• “Doing the right thing for the right reasons”.

• “Your own actions mirroring your words”.
Those who possess these virtues possess them in so far as they recognize certain considerations (such as the fact of a promise, or of a neighbour’s need) as powerful, and in many circumstances compelling reasons for acting. They recognize the reasons and act on them.

(Foot, p. 12)
In the Full Character Definition

Moreover, it (character) is action-guiding, in that a person with character does not merely do the right thing, but rather sees certain facts as reasons for action.
Brief Character Definition

Character motivates our actions and consists of character traits as well as practical wisdom that guides and regulates the exercise of those traits. Everyone has character, but at the Kern Institute, we are focused on the discovery, nurturing, and celebration of good character.

Character is consistent over time and requires authenticity as a deep reflection of who we are. This does not mean that a physician of character will never make a mistake, or will never act unethically. These mistakes or lapses though are an opportunity for growth.

Caring is a character trait, but it is also essential to practical wisdom for the physician.

Lastly, we believe that character can and should be “caught, taught, and sought”.
Jubilee Center studied the role of character in moral dilemmas in medicine with situational judgement tests.

• What character strengths are important in our decisions?
Small Group Activity
Example of Situational Judgment Test

The ICU team is working in their team room, right outside patient rooms. The team just received notification that a new admit is coming to their service, a patient with respiratory failure and sepsis. The senior resident assigns the patient to an intern and the junior medical student. After hearing report from the senior resident, the intern exclaims, “Why can’t I get a GI bleed? I haven’t had a GI bleed all month!” The team laughs in response.

The medical student notices a family member from a nearby patient room overhearing the discussion.

Inspired by Jubilee Centre
Dilemma to Consider

A. The medical student should confront the intern about her behavior.

B. The medical student should NOT confront the intern about her behavior.
Dilemma to Consider: Why?

**Student should speak up**

A. Doing so would be the courageous thing to do.

B. We have to treat people with respect even though no one is listening.

C. This situation could be a HIPAA violation or breach of privacy.

D. The student should speak up for the good of the team.

**Student should not speak up**

A. It’s not a medical student’s place to correct residents or attendings. The student can speak up when in a position of power.

B. Speaking up would put the student’s grade and residency match at risk.

C. Being a team player means withholding your opinions.

D. The intern was only joking.
Scenario Debrief

Dilemma: Should the medical student speak up and confront the intern about her behavior?

**YES**
1. Doing so would be the courageous thing to do.
2. We have to treat people with respect even though no one else is listening.
3. This situation could be a HIPAA violation or breach of privacy.
4. The student should speak up for the good of the team.

**NO**
1. It’s not a medical student’s place to correct residents or attendings. The student can speak up when in a position of power.
2. Speaking up would put the student’s grade and residency match at risk.
3. Being a team player means withholding your opinions.
4. The intern was only joking.
Jubilee Centre Resource

http://www.jubileecentre.ac.uk/1555/projects/gratitude-britain/virtuous-medical-practice
Questions/Discussion
Your Character Thoughts
Creative Commons License

Attribution-NonCommercial-Share Alike 3.0 Unported

You are free:
• to Share — to copy, distribute and transmit the work
• to Remix — to adapt the work

Under the following conditions:
• Attribution. You must give the original authors credit (but not in any way that suggests that they endorse you or your use of the work).
• Noncommercial. You may not use this work for commercial purposes.
• Share Alike. If you alter, transform, or build upon this work, you may distribute the resulting work only under a license identical to this one.

See http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/ for full license.
Resources

2. Self-Compassion Test: http://self-compassion.org/test-how-self-compassionate-you-are/
5. CASPer Test: https://takecasper.com/sample-casper-content